



Economic and Social Research Council

PRODUCTIVITY AND GROWTH: PAST AND FUTURE TRENDS 9 November 2022



















AGENDA











Recent trends in growth and productivity

Why has growth slowed down?

The role of ICT and digital transformation Projections of economic growth

Towards an intangible and sustainable economy



THE ECONOMY HAS BECOME "PRODUCTIVITY-POOR"

Euro Area has become more labour intensive and productivity poor ...



... even more visible in Finland



Source: The Conference Board, 2022



In fact the productivity slowdown is a global problem

(trend growth of global output per person employed)

Increase in productivity (GDP per hour) has slowed for almost 15 years across OECD (in US\$ PPP)



Source: The Conference Board, 2022

Note: Trend growth rates are obtained using HP filtering method



GROWTH ACCOUNTING APPROACH





EUROPEAN ECONOMIES HAVE ALSO BECOME "TFP-POOR": CAPITAL IS THE KEY BUT WEAKENING DRIVER OF GROWTH



Source: The Conference Board, 2022



CAUSES OF THE GROWTH SLOWDOWN

- Exacerbating effects from the *global financial crisis*
 - Slow demand
 - Weak investment
 - Too low interest rates
 - Failing fiscal policies
- *Slowing catch-up growth* in emerging markers, especially China one-off bonus gone?
- Greater share of *low-productivity personal services* in advanced economies ("Baumol effect")
- **Demographics**: ageing population, declining labour supply and weakening demand
- Structural policy effects: increased regulation, lack of competition, declining global trade, FDI, supply chains
- Transformational challenges: climate crisis, stagflation, inequality
- *Measurement problems*: output and inputs in a digital and intangible economy are harder to catch in the statistics
- Weaker technological change and innovation:
 - Technology and innovation pessimism & winner-takes-all effects
 - The Productivity Paradox of the New Digital Economy



A REVIVAL OF THE PRODUCTIVITY PARADOX

Putting productivity growth in perspective 4.5% 1965: President Eisenhower Goldman Sachs signs legislation authorizing the economists 2001: Tech 4.0% funding and construction of the expect 1.5% stock bubble interstate highway, system. trend productivit bursts. 1973: The first oil price shock growth over the ushers in an era of inflation and 3.5% next decade. lower growth and productivity. TECH BOOM 1987: Economist Robert Solow 3.0% POST-WAR PRODUCTIVITY "GOLDEN AGE" guips that 'computers are 2008: Global everywhere but in the Financial productivity statistics." 2.5% Crisis. 2000: Over half 2.0% of US households own a computer, up 1970: The optical SLOWDOWN & PRODUCTIVITY PARADOX 1.5% from 8% in 1984. PARADOX 2.0 fiber is invented. 2003: Skype 1971: Intel introduces launches. 1991: The worldwide web the microprocessor chip. 1.0% becomes accessible to the general public. 1975: Intel co-founder Gordon 1964: IBM unveils the 1992: GPS becomes fully 2013: 51% of US adults Moore revises his outlook for 1999: Apple first computer capable 0.5% bank online. operational. processor capacity, predicting popularizes WiFi by of supporting a variety 2014: 90% of US adults 1985: Microsoft (accurately) that it would incorporating a WiFi of applications. have a cell phone; 64% releases Windows 1.0. double every two years. slot into its laptops. have a smartphone. 0.0% 56 58 60 62 64 66 68 70 72 74 76 78 80 82 98 00 02 04 84 86 88 90 92 94 96 06 08 10 12 14

Year-over-year growth in nonfarm business sector productivity, 5y moving average ---- Averages for four main post-war productivity periods Source: BLS, Pew Research Center, US Census, PBS, various news sources, Goldman Sachs Global Investment Research.





The Old Digital Economy (1980s-mid 2000s)

Digitization driven by the rise of the PC and the internet as key drivers of greater business efficiency, creating access for individuals to digitization and the beginning of e-commerce.

The New Digital Economy (as of mid 2000s)

Digitization driven by a combination of mobile technology; ubiquitous internet access; shift toward cloud, and more recently artificial intelligence and robotics

DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION is an enterprise strategy that leverages digital technologies and the data they produce to connect organizations, people, physical assets and processes, etc.





CONTRIBUTION OF ICT CAPITAL TO LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY STABILIZED BUT TFP GROWTH DID NOT RECOVER

European Union-27





Finland



MOST DIGITAL-INTENSIVE INDUSTRIES CONTRIBUTE TO PRODUCTIVITY GROWTH BUT DIGITAL PRODUCERS IN EUROPE DROP OFF

DIGITAL INDUSTRY TAXONOMY

NACE SECTORS		Used in this study
А	Agriculture, forestry & fishing	LDIU
В	Mining & quarrying	LDIU
10-12	Food, beverages & tobacco	LDIU
13-15	Textiles & leather	LDIU
16-18	Wood, paper, printing & media	MDIU
19	Coke & petroleum products	LDIU
20-21	Chemicals	LDIU
22-23	Rubber & plastics; non-metallic mineral	LDIU
24-25	Basic metals & metal products	LDIU
26-27	Electrical & optical equip.	DP
28	Machinery & equipment n.e.c.	MDIU
29-30	Transport equipment	MDIU
31-33	Other manufacturing	MDIU
D-E	Electricity, gas & water supply	LDIU
F	Construction	LDIU
G	Trade	MDIU
н	Transportation & storage	LDIU
I	Accommodation & food services	LDIU
58-60	Publishing & broadcasting	DP
61	Telecommunications	DP
62-63	IT & information services	DP
к	Financial & insurance activities	MDIU
L	Real estate activities	LDIU
M-N	Professional services	MDIU
0	Public administration & defence	MDIU
Р	Education	LDIU
Q	Health & social work	LDIU
R	Arts, entertainment & recreation	MDIU
S	Other services	MDIU

Note: * Based on OECD's 2013-2015 grouping. LDIU=Least digital intensive using, DP=Digital Producing, MDIU=Most digital intensive-using, M-LOW=Medium Low, M-HIGH=Medium High, LIIU=Least ICT intensive-using and MIIU=Most ICT intensive -sing Sources: Van Ark, Erumban and de Vries (2019), based on OECD (2018), Van Ark et al (2016)

LaboUr productivity growth and contributions from digitalproducing and –using sectors, in %



Source: van Ark, de Vries, Erumban (2021)



HOW TO GET GROWTH BACK ON TRACK?





PROJECTED GROWTH ACCOUNTS IN THE CONFERENCE BOARD GLOBAL ECONOMIC OUTLOOK MODEL

- Labor quantity projections are based on workingage population growth rates.
- Labor quality projections are based on projections of educational attainment and average returns to schooling.
- Capital input projections are estimated based on structural factors such as the saving rate, depreciation rate, capital deepening, wage growth, etc.
- Total factor productivity (TFP) projections are estimated using structural factors such as corruption, growth in R&D, the Human Development Index, etc.
- Resultant GDP projections should be thought of as potential or trend growth rates—i.e., what the economy could be producing when it fully employs its available economic resources (at normal levels).



Source: US Congressional Budget Office

For more details, please refer to our working paper: https://www.conference-board.org/topics/global-economicoutlook/Global-Growth-Projections-2018



DEMOGRAPHICS IS A MAJOR FORCE BEHIND WEAKENING GROWTH DYNAMICS

The Euro Area workforce is ageing and shrinking



Euro Area: Employment by broad age-groups (millions)

Data up to 2020 taken from Eurostat. Data for 2025, 2030 and 2035 are based on own assumptions regarding participation rates combined with population projections sourced from the UN World Population Prospects 2022 Source: The Conference Board calculations using data from Eurostat and UN • Created with Datawrapper

- An ageing population requires less investment in the economy
- The demand for less-capital intensive & lower productivity services, such as tourism and elderly care, will rise
- The role of the public sector, which struggles more with new technologies and innovation, becomes larger
- The evidence on productivity of older workers is mixed: level of education, reskilling, sector composition, health & well-being play large roles

PRODUCTIVITY PROJECTED GROWTH ACCOUNTS FOR FINLAND, 2000-2039











Source: The Conference Board, Global Economic Outlook (October 2022)

<u>https://www.conference-</u> board.org/topics/global-economic-outlook



ECONOMIC GROWTH IS PROJECTED TO STABILIZE BUT REQUIRING MORE INVESTMENT AND TFP GROWTH





THE RISE OF THE INTANGIBLE ECONOMY

Tangible Assets

Equipment Machinery Buildings Vehicles ICT hardware Land



Intangible Assets

Software & databases

Innovation property:

- R&D
- Mineral exploration
- Design & originals

Economic competencies

- Market research & branding
- Organisational capital

You Can'l

Touch II

Business training



Non-farm market sector real intangible

Source: EUKLEMS-INTANProd, 2021



Note: Weighted aggregate for Germany, France, Italy, Spain, UK and US Source: EUKLEMS-INTANProd, 2021



DESPITE THE GROWTH SLOWDOWN, THE CONTRIBUTION OF INTANGIBLE CAPITAL HAS INCREASED

Tangible Assets Equipment Intangible capital contribution to labor Machinery Tangible capital contribution to labor Buildings productivity growth (ppt) productivity growth (ppt) Vehicles 0.6 **ICT** hardware 0.4 Land 0.5 0.3 0.4 You Can 0.2 Touch It 0.3 0.1 0.2 0.0 Intangible Assets -0.1 0.1 Software & databases 0.0 -0.2 Innovation property: • R&D -0.1 -0.3 998-2006 998-2006 2011-2018 998-2006 2011-2018 998-2006 998-2006 998-2006 2011-2018 998-2006 2011-2018 2011-2018 998-2006 2011-2018 Mineral exploration 1998-2006 2011-2018 2011-2018 2011-2018 998-2006 œ 2011-2018 • Design & originals **Economic competencies** Market research & FR DE ES FR DE ES FI branding IT FI IT Organisational capital

Business training

You Can



TOWARDS A BROADER INVESTMENT CONCEPT OF INPUTS AND OUTPUTS

Output / Input = Economic Productivity





Source: Heys, Martin and Mkandawire, GDP and Welfare: A spectrum of opportunity , ESCoE Discussion Paper 2019-16

Outcome / Resources = Societal Productivity



https://www.productivity.ac.uk/



Source data: THE CONFERENCE BOARD

THE CONFERENCE BOARD

The Conference Board Productivity Brief 2022

Global Labor Productivity

Stagnating, But Still Above Prepandemic Levels





Global Economic Outlook 2023 Euro Area Edition: Recession in the Short Term Gives Way to Weaker Growth in the Longer Term



The Conference Board, Total Economy Database (April 2022)

https://www.conferenceboard.org/data/economydatabase/

The Conference Board, Global Economic Outlook (October 2022)

https://www.conferenceboard.org/topics/global-economicoutlook



The Productivity Institute



Economic and Social Research Council





Human capital



Knowledge capital



Macroeconomic trends and policy







Organisational capital



Geography and place



Institutions and governance



Social, environmental and technological transitions



- 3



TPI'S MISSON AND HOW WE ARE GOING TO ACHIEVE THIS



Lay the foundations for an era of sustained and inclusive productivity growth and help policy makers and business leaders across the UK understand how to improve productivity and raise living standards

Interdisciplinary approaches

Interaction between research, policy and business

Develop a clear narrative around productivity



Make link to business competitiveness

Identify regional specificities

Make link to access to education, health, and a better environment "



Solving the Productivity Puzzle requires getting many things right



Invest in people, ideas and your organisation *Leverage power of place* Human Knowledge Organisational Geography and capital capital capital place

Macroeconomic Institutions and Social, environmental and Measurement

Collaborate

governance

trends and policy

Measure success

and methods

Focus on the big picture

technological transitions